

Report of the Town Engineer Screening Committee

May 12, 2009

Our Task:

The Town Engineer Screening Committee is pleased to submit its final report. Our charge, as we understood it, was to apply the Quality Based Selection (QBS) process to narrow the Statement of Qualifications (SOQ) submitted by firms interested in being our Town Engineer to a list of three (3) for final interviews and ranking by the SelectBoard.

Our Recommendation:

The firms that we are submitting to you, in alphabetical order, are:

KV Partners, LLC of Gilford, NH
Provan & Lorber, Inc. of Contoocook & Littleton, NH
Underwood Engineers, Inc. of Concord & Portsmouth, NH

Our Process:

We met on five (5) occasions to become familiar with the QBS process, prepare a scoring matrix to review the SOQs, finalize a scoresheet to be used for reference checks, and then prepare interview questions and a scoring matrix for an in person interview to finalize the recommendation above. The Town staff constructed a web page on the Town site so that interested citizens could follow our work. Each of the committee members invested, individually, almost 22 hours in this effort.

Prior to our start the Town staff had prepared and issued a Request for Qualifications (Exhibit A). This was advertised in the Meredith News, Carroll County Independent and Manchester Union Leader as well as mailed to, and posted on, well over 125+ parties and web sites.

As a result of this effort, we received SOQs from ten (10) firms. Each committee member independently reviewed the submissions and scored them upon one of our scoring sheets. Those scoring sheets were then turned in at a public meeting and entered into a spreadsheet to place the firms in ranked order. After a review of the scores, a decision was made to interview five firms. The firms were all given a predetermined question to answer and about two weeks to prepare. That question was:

You have seen our Request for Qualifications. You have seen our sample projects for the upcoming year and the typical range of the fees we pay in a year. You know we are a small municipality. Why are you the best fit to be our Town engineer?

During the time period running up to the interview, each committee member was assigned one firm and made a series of phone calls to collect recommendations.

The night of the interview the committee worked from a checklist and set of score sheets which assigned values to 13 different criteria and questions (Exhibit B). The scoring sheets were collected after each interview and put into an Excel spreadsheet.

Upon the conclusion of all interviews the committee members reported on their findings with respect to references. Upon the conclusion of that discussion, the rankings calculated by the spreadsheet, from high to low were announced. The committee then took an opportunity to discuss their reactions to each of the firms and the merit of the order. The group decided no changes were merited and the list would stand. That is what is presented to you above.

Copies of all the score sheets and submissions are available in the files in the planning offices.

Having completed our task we thank you for the opportunity to serve the Town and ask that we be dissolved.

Respectfully submitted this 12th day of May, 2009.

Ed Ambrose
Peter Jensen
Scott Kinmond
Don LeMien
Barbara Rando

Town of Moultonborough Engineering Firm Selection Matrix

		E. Ambrose					P. Jensen					S. Kinmond					D. LeMien					B. Rando				
		Underwood Engineers, Inc.	The H.L. Turner Group, Inc.	KV Partners, LLC	H. E. Bergeron Engineers	Provan & Lorber, Inc.	Underwood Engineers, Inc.	The H.L. Turner Group, Inc.	KV Partners, LLC	H. E. Bergeron Engineers	Provan & Lorber, Inc.	Underwood Engineers, Inc.	The H.L. Turner Group, Inc.	KV Partners, LLC	H. E. Bergeron Engineers	Provan & Lorber, Inc.	Underwood Engineers, Inc.	The H.L. Turner Group, Inc.	KV Partners, LLC	H. E. Bergeron Engineers	Provan & Lorber, Inc.	Underwood Engineers, Inc.	The H.L. Turner Group, Inc.	KV Partners, LLC	H. E. Bergeron Engineers	Provan & Lorber, Inc.
Q #		Int. (1 to 5)					Int. (1 to 5)					Int. (1 to 5)					Int. (1 to 5)					Int. (1 to 5)				
1	Int.	4	3	4	4	4	3	3	4	3	5	3	2	4	3	3	5	3	5	5	5	4	2	3	?	2
2		4	4	4	4	3	3	5	5	3	5	4	3	4	3	3	4	4	5	3	4	4	2	2	?	3
3		1	1	1	1	3	3	4	4	3	4	3	3	4	3	4	4	2	4	4	5	4	3	2	2	2
4		2	5	4	2	4	4	4	4	5	5	3	3	4	3	4	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	2	4
5		4	4	5	4	5	5	3	5	3	4	3	4	4	3	4	5	5	4	3	5	5	4	5	1	3
Pres. (Y/N)		Pres. (Y/N)					Pres. (Y/N)					Pres. (Y/N)					Pres. (Y/N)					Pres. (Y/N)				
1		Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
2		Y				Y	Y		Y			Y		Y		Y	Y		Y		Y					
3		Y	Y	Y		Y	Y		Y		Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y		
4			Y				Y	Y	Y				Y	Y			Y	Y	Y		Y		Y	Y		Y
5		Y	Y	Y		Y	Y		Y			Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y
6		Y	Y	Y		Y	Y		Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y				Y
7		Y	Y		Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
8			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
9		Y	Y	Y		Y		Y	Y	Y	Y		Y			Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y	Y		Y
10				Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y		Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y
11				Y		Y			Y		Y			Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	Y	Y
12		Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Pres. Score		Pres. Score (1 to 5)					Pres. Score (1 to 5)					Pres. Score (1 to 5)					Pres. Score (1 to 5)					Pres. Score (1 to 5)				
1		2	3	3	2	4	3	3	5	4	5	2	1	4	1	4	3	2	2	2	5	3	2	5	2	5
2		3	3	4	2	4	3	4	5	1	4	2	3	4	1	5	5	4	5	5	4	3	2	5	3	5
3		4	3	4	4	5	5	3	5	3	5	3	2	5	2	5	4	1	2	4	5	3	2	4	2	5
4		5	5	5	5	5	4	5	5	4	5	5	3	5	3	4	5	5	4	5	5	5	4	5	3	5
5		3	2	4	4	5	4	3	5	2	5	3	3	4	1	5	4	2	2	2	5	4	2	4	1	4
6		3	3	4	3	4	4	4	5	3	4	3	4	4	2	4	4	2	3	3	5	3	3	4	1	5
7		4	3	4	3	4	4	4	5	2	5	3	3	5	1	4	4	2	2	3	4	3	3	5	1	5
8		4	2	4	4	5	4	4	5	3	5	3	2	4	2	5	3	3	2	3	5	3	2	5	2	5
Mmbrs Total		43	41	50	42	55	49	49	62	39	61	40	36	55	28	54	55	39	44	46	61	48	35	53	20	53

Firm Total

Provan & Lorber, Inc.	284
KV Partners, LLC	264
Underwood Engineers, Inc.	235
The H.L. Turner Group, Inc.	200
H. E. Bergeron Engineers	175



PLEASE POST
CONTRACT OPPORTUNITY
TOWN OF MOULTONBOROUGH

Request for Qualifications
Town Engineer

The Town is accepting Statements of Qualifications (SOQs) from single firms or joint ventures seeking to serve as the Town Engineer for the coming 3 year period which may be extended for an equal term.

The work to be performed is general transportation and civil engineering (i.e. drainage, pavement preservation and reconstruction work), landscape architecture (i.e. recreation fields construction, reconstruction) and light architectural/structural analysis and design (i.e. bridges, roofs and building code compliance). Work will include planning, design and cost estimating, bidding and construction administration. The contract will be subject to negotiation of individual work orders. There is no guaranteed minimum amount of work guaranteed per year.

Firms, including consultants thereto, must have at least one professional in each required discipline registered within the state of New Hampshire and a minimum staffing complement of five persons. Although the registration requirements may be met through the use of consultants, the prime firm must meet the staffing requirements and provide a Project Manager/Client representative with at least a Professional Engineer (PE) registration.

Preference will be given to local firms (i.e. within fifty miles). Firms will only be considered local if their office is within the listed radius, or they have a locally independently operated branch and all of the design, coordination and management of projects will be accomplished in that office. Submissions must address the following:

- 1.) A history of the firm(s);
- 2.) A comprehensive list of similar projects (maximum twenty (20) in total for all types);
- 3.) Identification, resumé and role of the Project Manager(s) to be assigned;
- 4.) Identification, resumé and role of other individuals which may be assigned to the Town's Projects; and
- 5.) A listing of your last twenty projects including the original cost estimate, the contract award price (if it went to bid) , the final contract value, and the reason for any variance more than 5% therein.

Detailed information may be found at www.moultonboroughnh.gov (Paid, Volunteer, and Contract Openings). Selection will be conducted in accordance with standard NH DOT QBS criteria as may be modified to account for the non-highway projects that will be part of this contract. Five copies of the SOQs must be submitted to Mr. Carter Terenzini, Town Administrator, 6 Holland Street, PO Box 139, Moultonborough, NH 03254 by the close of business on Thursday, April 23, 2009.

Posted: Town Bulletin Boards (7)
SAU

Advertised: Meredith News & Carroll County Independent 03/26/09 & 04/02/09
Manchester Union Leader 03/29/09 & 04/05/09
Mailed: NHLGC Mailing List and Annual Conference Attendees
Web: Craigslist; winnipesaukee.com; NHLGC; Professional Firm Associations